

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

TRIUMPH FOODS, LLC, CHRISTENSEN FARMS MIDWEST, LLC, THE HANOR COMPANY OF WISCONSIN, LLC, NEW FASHION PORK, LLP, EICHELBERGER FARMS, INC., and ALLIED PRODUCERS' COOPERATIVE, individually and on behalf of its members,

Plaintiffs,

v.

ANDREA JOY CAMPBELL, in her official capacity as Attorney General of Massachusetts, and ASHLEY RANDLE, in her official capacity as Massachusetts Commissioner of Agriculture,

Defendants.

CIVIL ACTION  
NO. 1:23-cv-11671-WGY

**DEFENDANTS'  
MOTION TO DISMISS THE AMENDED COMPLAINT  
FOR LACK OF ARTICLE III JURISDICTION**

Defendants, Andrea Joy Campbell, in her official capacity as Attorney General of Massachusetts, and Ashley Randle, in her official capacity as Massachusetts Commissioner of the Department of Agricultural Resources, hereby move to dismiss the Plaintiffs' amended complaint under Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1).

For the Court to have jurisdiction under Article III of the U.S. Constitution, a plaintiff must demonstrate that it has suffered an injury in fact that is concrete, particularized, and actual or imminent. Plaintiff Triumph Foods, LLC ("Triumph") has not made this demonstration. While Massachusetts customers have bought millions of pounds of Triumph product, all sales of Triumph product are controlled by Seaboard Foods, LLC ("Seaboard"), a non-party, under an

agreement between Triumph and Seaboard. Triumph has not shown that Seaboard cannot continue to meet its obligation to sell Triumph product pursuant to the agreement, regardless of Massachusetts' policies. Triumph has not substantiated harm *to Triumph* causally connected to the Massachusetts Prevention of Farm Animal Cruelty Act. Given each Plaintiffs' reliance on Triumph's standing for establishing jurisdiction, and Triumph's failure to make the necessary showing at this stage of the proceedings, the entire Amended Complaint is subject to dismissal for lack of jurisdiction.

For the reasons stated in Defendants' Memorandum in Support of Their Motion to Dismiss the Amended Complaint for Lack of Article III Jurisdiction, which Defendants respectfully incorporate herein, Defendants respectfully request that the Court dismiss the Amended Complaint.

Respectfully submitted,

ANDREA JOY CAMPBELL, in her official capacity as Attorney General of Massachusetts, and

ASHLEY RANDLE, in her official capacity as Commissioner of the Massachusetts Department of Agricultural Resources,

By their attorneys,

/s/ Maryanne Reynolds

Maryanne Reynolds, BBO No. 627127  
Assistant Attorney General  
Massachusetts Office of the Attorney General  
Constitutional and Administrative Law Division  
10 Mechanic Street, Suite 301  
Worcester, MA 01608  
774-214-4407  
[maryanne.reynolds@mass.gov](mailto:maryanne.reynolds@mass.gov)

Grace Gohlke, BBO No. 704218  
Vanessa A. Arslanian, BBO No. 688099  
Assistant Attorneys General

Massachusetts Office of the Attorney General  
Constitutional and Administrative Law Division  
One Ashburton Place  
Boston, MA 02108  
617-963-2527  
[grace.gohlke@mass.gov](mailto:grace.gohlke@mass.gov)  
617-963-2107  
[vanessa.arslanian@mass.gov](mailto:vanessa.arslanian@mass.gov)

Dated: December 18, 2023

**LOCAL RULE 7.1 CERTIFICATION**

I hereby certify that prior to filing this motion I conferred with opposing counsel on December 18, 2023, by emails exchanged, and attempted in good faith to resolve or narrow the issue. Counsel requested additional time to confer on the Exhibit B, which Defendants have honored, and therefore are not filing Exhibit B until further conference, which the parties expect will occur on December 19. Counsel further requested that the motion not be filed until after further conference, which they proposed be held after the December 19 case stated hearing. Defendants declined.

*/s/ Maryanne Reynolds*  
Maryanne Reynolds  
Assistant Attorney General

**Certificate of Service**

I hereby certify that this document filed through the ECF system will be sent electronically to the registered participants as identified on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF), and paper copies will be sent to those indicated as non-registered participants.

*/s/ Maryanne Reynolds*  
Maryanne Reynolds  
Assistant Attorney General

Dated: December 18, 2023